

A Small Manual of Piety and a Curriculum for the Plague:

After Bertolt Brecht's *Die Hauspostille**

Jerry Zaslove

“Es steht nicht mehr bereit” or, “There’s no life after this, nothing significant awaits you.”¹

A Guide to the Use of this Curriculum of Breviaries or Individual Lessons for a Short Course on Plagues.²

Why a Breviary? An instruction manual allows the freedom for revelation and fragmentariness that reminds of prayer and supplication in dark times of obfuscation and debased discourse that covers over the now-visible and forbidden-to-speak-of class conflict and the division of labour rearranged as if a pandemic is new news. And further: any speaking of “division of labour” becomes muffled into “essential services.” The arrangement of my Imaginary Course of Readings and Images tracks my devotional readings in a lapidary arrangement of Lessons—A Primer for an Untaught Course. I am a writer and teacher in search of a Schema for Partisan-Anarchist Thinking, reading and writing and planning against the “colossal crimes” of what appears to the innocent and experienced alike to be an epoch without history.³ Breviaries are also devotionals, instructions we should not be without. The danger: return to a universal religion or a universal death wish. On the other hand, when push comes to prophecy and disaster as it does with certain tribes when they experience disaster, they construct stories about a time when hunters and gatherers thrived, but when warfare and pandemics occur it reveals for all to see how the entire economic and system of

* Republished from *Contours*, Issue 10: Fall 2020. Edited and reformatted for publication.

surplus and exchange is discovered and laid bare for all to see, and how prophets, wizards and failed Chiefs will emerge as salvationists.⁴

These are scenes for a “Song-play,” in German a *Singspiel*, like Brecht’s and Weill’s “City of Mahagonny,” the utopia where everything is allowed and nothing is permitted. The Breviaries are conceived as both material and a tableau in search of the appropriate music to perform the Breviaries.⁵

Breviary I. First Lesson: Epochs of Phantasmagorias

Readings:

Giovanni Boccaccio, from *The Decameron*

Walter Benjamin, “The Storyteller”

Image:

Pieter Breughel, *Dulle Griet* (Mad Meg)

Measuring history by Epochs of Time. So then, Time Suffers and then Time and the Phantasmagoria plague us. Art works are our evidence of the difficulty of understanding how the dialectic of time moves through “suffering time.” We long for “progress,” but views of history that claim “progress” lead to the death of others. We count them. One is too many. The interpretation of meanings given to time are diverse and are passed on to others not just through “ideas,” but through images of ideas in society. To “know thyself” (and “nothing human is alien to me”) begins the search for the forms of human expressiveness and the critical feelings. I teach the history of critical emotions. The study of the humanities typically begins with timelines and how we measure change and continuity. The European traditions give us many timelines and ways we measure time: cycles of nature, myths, legends, heroic figures, epochs, periods, great men, martyrs, heroes, battles, wars, inventions, revolutions, social movements, cultural changes, breaks and ruptures,

generations. Don't forget *modus* = measurement = movement, floating, transience, flowing, fading and recovering memory and forgetting. Institutions create "official" memory and then the humanities emerge willy-nilly as a critique of institutions and the official forms of memory—that is tradition. Plagues arrest the flow of time. Now-time is the frozenness of time. Frozen speech is the speech of absolutists says Rabelais in *Gargantua and Pantagruel* in Book IV, Chapter 3 which we shall read! The European consciousnesses of time: the archaic, messianic, eschatological, redemptive, millennial, and utopic maybe gives us a sense that our experiences are part of a larger *flow* of what can be called "epochal time"—that is, time as a function of space and nature—the cosmological? We know too that "humanities" includes "science" and that the "humanities" does not protect us from barbarism: thus, the Breviaries.

Breviary II. Second Lesson: Measuring Time

Reading:

Walter Benjamin, "Theses on the Philosophy of History"

The *messianic* lets us know of a break or coming break in time and prophesizes a "new time," when a new set of beliefs startles us with a figure or movement that represents new time. The old beliefs are "transvalued" and lead to a new equality or social justice or realms of freedom. *Redemptive* time means that past acts or events are recovered in time and are recreated by forgiveness or by overcoming mourning or the violation of a taboo or deep code or beliefs that were imposed by an outside force. *Eschatological* time predicts the coming events based on signs from the past and then history begins from the point of that prediction. *Millennial* time invites us to look back for a time when history begins and periods end. In *apocalyptic* cultures one awaits signs of "end time" or breaks, or "profane illuminations" like revolutions, or hidden signs that

“apo”—the near—is no longer “secret” but is now “revealed” (calyptic), but it has been, without our knowing it, there “side by side” with us all along and we haven’t seen it. Turns our heads inward! The fear we have lies in the emptiness of prognostication and time.

Breviary III. Third Lesson: Why are we Afraid of Revolutions?

Readings:

Bertolt Brecht, *Mother Courage*

Hannah Arendt, *On Revolution*

Karl Marx, *1844 Manuscripts*

The *utopic or anarchic* is an imaginary placeway where we become conscious of the ways we work out our communal identifications and break free from coerced ends and beginnings, powers, and dominations. Typically, one might even “force freedom,” which gets us into trouble, for the good of the communal or the People or Nation. Often the utopic or anarchic is marked by free association, self-regulation, the admission of fantasy to everyday life (imagination), and we abolish the division of labour and act out in the name of self-expression. However, there’s also Social Death where we measure time by the catastrophes.

Breviary IV. Fourth Lesson: Brecht and Benjamin

Readings:

Walter Benjamin, *Conversations with Brecht*

Charlotte Beradt, *Third Reich of Dreams*

Franz Kafka, *In the Penal Colony*

Jaroslav Hasek, *Good Soldier Svejk*

Image:

Bertolt Brecht and Kurt Weill, “The City of Mahagonny Singspiel”

The Nazi Party (NSDAP) made itself into a “*workers party state*,” so they attacked the unions first and then independent associations, religious, cultural, academic, and professional. Why? To incorporate them into the state or to isolate them from “natural law” which the state would pursue. Franz Neuman named the German Expanding State the *Leviathan State* which was a Labour State in which private economic activity must be subordinated to the bureaucracy and the normative administrative state. Lucky for them, an already existing Bismarckian bureaucracy and modified welfare state existed, so they only had to install party members into the fabric or ensure that the workers became party members. In addition, a surveillance structure was installed. The military expanded into a vast spy network bringing thugs into the street who broke the windows of Jewish storekeepers. This was well known and feared by the common citizen and for Jews ended up we know where, not only in their dreams and nightmares, which Charlotte Beradt recounts in *The Third Reich of Dreams*. The work of the party ensured that the economic forces and political state were coordinated with an elaborate legal framework. That created big problems for the corporations, many of which needed Jewish money and international finance which they were loath to abandon. The struggle: to ensure that everything was outwardly legal but remained capitalist, while the “worker state” became the *Kulturation*. The *Kulturation* “naturalized” everyday life into the Terror State. Fear turned up everywhere and so were social security and armaments brought together in the heroic New Individual. The Nuremberg Laws extended the legal “Prerogative, One-Party State,” named correctly by Ernst Fraenkel, that embedded a racialized normative legal system into labour. Nationalist ideology of the Party State gained and held power at all costs. Costs are nothingness. This, then, is the “Fascist Public Sphere.” Robert Ley, Minister of Labour, organized “shop troops” in the factories and bureaucracies, ensuring that the Nazi labour organizations did not become communist through the ideology of worker

solidarity. Worker-contra-worker ensured that labour was celebrated by the staged Party rallies. Schismatic religions like Anabaptists, Quakers, Jehovah Witnesses, and eventually Jews, atheists, anarchists, or Marxists and their "civil" organizations were deracinated because religious sects are a danger to the prerogative State. The radical Protestant labour movements were watched carefully. Rule by emergency declarations became the norm. This, the Nuremberg Laws, among other decrees, separated, banned and eliminated the Jews from everyday life; this was just the beginning of the plague over everyday life. The Enemy: The Weimar Constitution, Bourgeois labour law, Jewish-owned businesses, fear and envy of Russian Communism.⁶

Breviary V. Fifth Lesson: Peter Weiss, *Aesthetics of Resistance and Scattergrams of Plague: Who are You to Speak of Plagues?*

Images:

Peter Weiss, *Marat-Sade*, 1964 (Film)

Jeff Wall, *Dead Troops Talk A Vision after an Ambush of a Red Army Near Moqor, Afghanistan, Winter, 1986*⁷

Pergamon Frieze, Berlin Pergamon Altar Frieze sculpture in Berlin: a Gigantomachy portraying the Greek-Persian wars⁸

Peter Weiss, in *Aesthetics of Resistance* in three volumes, writes his own history of resistance that brings together his readings on art, for example Delacroix and Breughel, and his own autobiographical account of his wanderings and exile in and out of revolution and friendship with revolutionaries, also visiting Brecht and family in Svenborg, Sweden. I here paraphrase the opening of Volume One: when we see all around us the bodies rising out of the stone, crowded into groups, intertwined or shattered into fragments, hinting at their shapes and the strangleholds of their twisted figures and so . . . Like stones on a field reaching to the horizon there are symptoms, symptoms, symptoms, a gigantic primitive agony, a scattergram of symptoms like any and all plagues and states of war. Genocidal processes: millions of people starving to death, millions of

children without homes or shelter; refugees around the world crammed into overcrowded cities in poverty-stricken countries; mass unemployment in rich countries; ecological catastrophes, violent and anomic actions of and against the state . . . who are You Authorities to speak of Plagues . . . ?

Breviary VI. From Walter Benjamin, “Theses on the Philosophy of History”

“To historians who wish to relive an era, Fustel de Coulanges recommends that they blot out everything they know about the later course of history. There is no better way of characterising the method with which historical materialism has broken . . . The nature of this sadness stands out more clearly if one asks with whom the adherents of historicism actually empathize. The answer is inevitable: with the victor. And all rulers are the heirs of those who conquered before them. Hence, empathy with the victor invariably benefits the rulers. Historical materialists know what that means. Whoever has emerged victorious participates to this day in the triumphal procession in which the present rulers step over those who are lying prostrate. There is no document of civilization which is not at the same time a document of barbarism. And just as such a document is not free of barbarism, barbarism taints also the manner in which it was transmitted from one owner to another. A historical materialist therefore dissociates himself from it as far as possible. He regards it as his task to brush history against the grain.”⁹

Breviary VII. The Relevance of Freud: from *New Introductory Lectures*

In the June, 2016 Institute for the Humanities forum on “Psychoanalysis and the Trump Phenomenon,” I spoke about the immanent fascist publics coming alive in the liberal-democratic capitalist world: “The Fascist Public Sphere” grew and enabled the election of a demagogue whose malignant narcissism and clinical alexithymia—the inability to feel or relate to the emotion or

plight of another person—showed a character disorder that should have opened a discussion about psychoanalytical understanding of authority and delinquency in group formations and right-wing formations in the anxieties and fears of terror-filled groups around the world. Group formations are under siege. Militarized elites, monied brokers called “oligarchs,” exist everywhere and racialized groups pump their anxieties onto scapegoats. This leads to what Wilhelm Reich named “the emotional plague,” and what Freud restlessly referred to as the death drive that emerges when our ego-ideals fail us, and our omnipotence of thought turns our emotions into abstractions that promise us release from terrors. The terrors appear, not as man-made, but magically as acts of nature, floods, earthquakes, disease. Plagues appear to us as if nature has a second nature; we believe that wars, economic collapse, revolutions are not man-made, but are created by unknown forces not subject to analysis. Faced with the disintegration of the “ego” and the phantasmagoria of the forces of destruction in the natural world, the omnipotence of thought when faced with death turns our face away from already-existing *administered death*.¹⁰ Those who create and then exploit nearby anxiety draw upon a political cult of death that is nearby.

So then, Freud writes a brief history of the ego, and I quote:

No wonder that the ego so often fails in its task. Its three tyrannical masters are the external world, the super-ego and the id. When we follow the ego's efforts to satisfy them simultaneously—or rather, to obey them simultaneously—we cannot feel any regret at having personified this ego and having set it up as a separate organism. It feels hemmed in on three sides, threatened by three kinds of danger ... to which, if it is hard pressed, it reacts by generating anxiety ... earmarked for representing the demands of the external world, but it strives too to be a loyal servant of the id, to remain on good terms with it, to recommend itself to it as an object and to attract its libido to itself ... observed at every step it takes by the strict super-ego, which lays down definite standards for its conduct, without taking any account of its difficulties from the direction of the id and the external world, and which, if those standards are not obeyed, punishes it with tense feelings of inferiority and of guilt. Thus, the ego ... cannot suppress a cry: ‘Life is not easy!’ ... obliged to admit its weakness ... breaks out in anxiety—realistic anxiety regarding the external world, moral anxiety regarding the super-ego and neurotic anxiety regarding the strength of the passions in the id.¹¹

Breviary VIII. Bakhtin, *Rabelais and his World of Language* at the Edge of the Plague that turns the World Upside Down: we can say nothing more but speak through the Pathos of the Invective! The Id of Language?

Bakhtin and the Menippean Diatribe-Vituperative-Billingsgate-Scurrility-Abuse-Rant-Bombast-Rodomontade Fustian-Tirade-Diatribe-Jeremiad-Philippic-Harangue-Denunciatory . . .

“In the Renaissance, laughter in its most radical, universal, and at the same time gay form emerged from the depths of folk culture; it emerged but once in the course of history ... and entered with its popular (vulgar) language the sphere of great literature and high ideology.”

*Rabelais and his World*¹²

“Even this must have a preface - that is a literary preface,” laughed Ivan, “and I am a poor hand at such things. You see my story takes place in the sixteenth century. At that time, as you probably learned at school, it was customary in poetry to bring down heavenly powers on earth. Dante was not the only one to do this.”

Ivan Karamazov's preface to his tale of “The Grand Inquisitor” in *Brothers Karamazov*

Breviary IX. Breugel’s *Two Monkeys*¹³

There’s pathos in the idea of painting these monkeys at all *as worthy subject matter* and isolating it from any larger whole! One monkey is looking at the painter. The other monkey we really aren't sure. There is starvation in the scene. There are several “frames” in the painting. One, the window, and the other the window to the viewer. Why are they captured and chained? That's an estranging

device because we don't know; so, there is an interrogation in the picture, a judgement in the question of the Picturing itself. But we know that monkeys are kept for entertainment and street fairs! So, “devices” are also “interrogating” gestures. The scene outside is peaceful. The natural life of labour and the economy. The “utopia” of work and harvest. Yet, there is the fate of the monkeys, like the “fall” of Icarus to blind fate. Bringing the spectator into the “scene”—Breugel constructs the enigmatic. The painting functions like music about the end of any utopia. The painting *moves by showing* the figurative. The madness of the world is criticized but the world “moves.” There is fear, deadness, and the reminder of violence: the “monkeys” have lost what they are through their domestication into entertainment. This is a reminder of what “we” humans do. The painting engages time: the “contemporary,” the humanist “revolution” of the ethically-engaged spectator in the present: painters and writers engage everyday life, the grotesque, madness, terror, and the sublime. Nothing escapes the Plague of Everyday Life when the *division of labour is revealed to us as “essential labour.”*

Breviary X. A Restitution-Destruction Fantasy and Fascism’s Distorted Public Sphere

Readings:

Walter Benjamin, “Theses on the Philosophy of History,” IX

T.W. Adorno, *Minima Moralia: Reflections from a Damaged Life*¹⁴

Image:

Paul Klee, Angel Paintings and *Angelus Novus*¹⁵

“The dreamer encounters his own image impotently, as if it were a miracle, and is held fast in the inexorable circle of his own labour, as if it would last for ever. The object that he has forgotten he has made is dangled magically before his eyes, as if it were an absolutely objective manifestation. Governed by the logic of dreams, the phantasmagoria succumbs to its own particular dialectic.”¹⁶

Benjamin chronicles the emergence of the Fascist Spectacle public sphere and the institutionalized forms of everyday life into the Nazi Party in society that enforced a concept of the “public”—a fake public sphere of reality as ideology and ideology as reality. The Feudal Volk existed alongside of the Enlightenment ideals of the German-Jewish-European ethical humanist Parnassus; however, put the “Fascist Public Sphere” into a dictatorship over everyday life where human rights as democratic rights and democratic rights as human rights were no longer emancipatory rights and obligations. So then, the Nazis rearranged the idea of a public sphere against all palpable evidence that the actuality of the degeneration of a public could be enforced. A public was administered through laws against imaginary immanent plagues from within and beyond the German Reich’s borders where Pogroms flourished. Smothered and masked in law and decrees, the People become both Plague and Publicum ruled into Law by the *Plague of Emergency Measures*. Fascism as corporate-military-bureaucratic capitalism needed a concept of a revolution to inspire and defraud the Public. Wait: can’t we describe this “form” of life psychoanalytically, as a restitution/destruction fantasy? Estrangement and alienation merge into a non-objective form of being of power-protected inwardness—a non-objective being which is a non-being. Albert Speer’s architecture and slave labour camps lie behind, and in the future of *being as such*. The future of being *forecloses being as such*, because we are in the present now staring into a *plague-like* catastrophe that is beyond denial or repression and which some have experienced every day even before the plague.

Breviary XI. A SUPPLICATION. Assignment: Write a Meditation on Counting Virus Deaths. How can we become Up to Date?

But Wait! A Meditation on Counting Makes Me Feel Unclean.

I.
 speaking of counting
 Jews or not
 Armenians or not
 Others or not
 they are pointing out that the number of Covid deaths
 out-died Viet Nam deaths
 Hey!
 Fallacy of undistributed middle
 But it makes a certain point
 Wait in the undistributed middle
 How many Vietnamese died?
 This is the minefield
 One is too many.

II.
 Forgot
 Better look it up
 2 million civilians and 1.5 million soldiers

Breviary XII. “The Manual of Piety is intended for the reader’s use. It should not be senselessly wolfed down.”¹⁷

Breviary XIII. Postscriptum.

The Plague discloses our feelings of absence and mourning, but it's even the loss of mourning—the “loss of loss” comes with the feeling of total abandonment, when even “loss” is not a possible human feeling or consolation for deathly uncertainty. Loss is replaced by the “phantasmagoria” where there is no consoling for what is missing. We pick up the fragments that are strewn by the wayside. Or picked up are made into another delusional camouflage of ideology as reality, reality

as ideology. The canonization of death and the cults of assorted forms of fascisms emerge. But Wait. This course is about time to stop thinking about death on their terms. That's exactly what “they” don’t want us to do: to think about death as ideology as reality and reality as ideology. Adorno again: “Thinking no longer means anything more than checking at each moment whether one can indeed think . . . Hölderlin’s “if you have understanding and a heart show only one. Both they will damn, if both you show together.”¹⁸

Walter Benjamin, *The Origin of German Tragic Drama*: “It is indeed characteristic of the sadist that he humiliates his object and then—or thereby—satisfies it. And that is what the allegorist does in this age drunk with acts of cruelty lived and imagined.”¹⁹

The allegorist is comfortable with tableaux that show the epoch of capitalism in mock epic form. Tableaus open up scenes for fantasy, creating new associations, and experimenting with scenes that change conventions and a predictable sense of form. In short, reflecting on the work becomes part of the work itself.

Stage Directions for Scene 20 of *Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny*:

And amid increasing confusion, inflation and hostility of all against all, in the final weeks of the Network City those who had not yet been killed demonstrated for their ideals — having learned nothing.

*The rear projection screens show Mahagonny burning. Then the columns of demonstrators set off, chaotically criss-crossing and confronting one another, continuing right until the end.*²⁰

Readings

Bertolt Brecht, “Guide to the Use of the Individual Lessons,” *Manual of Piety*

Varlam Shalamov, *Kolyma Tales*

Bertolt Brecht and Kurt Weill, *Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny*

“Which ink is used to sign the death sentences—chemical ink, the India ink used in passports, the ink of fountainpens, alizarin? No death sentence has been signed simply in pencil . . . Only the simple graphite pencil is permitted. In Kolyma, graphite carries enormous responsibility.”²¹

Shalamov spent 17 years in Soviet prison camps in northeastern Siberia, both as a prisoner and as a medical orderly. Shalamov, as in much of Russian prose and poetry, crosses genre boundaries in recounting his life and the indifference of the populace to those who spent their lives in the prisons and Gulags. The recounting of a life in writing means thinking with the image of writing, and Russian writing is “digressive writing” always open to fantasy dialogue.

Science? The science of counting?

Noam Chomsky in an interview published in *Media Control* asks mordantly in Brechtian fashion:

How many Vietnamese casualties would you estimate that there were during the Vietnam war? The average response on the part of Americans today is about 100,000. The official figure is about two million. The actual figure is probably three to four million. The people who conducted the study raised an appropriate question: What would we think about German political culture if, when you asked people today how many Jews died in the Holocaust, they estimated, about 300,000? What would that tell us about German political culture?²²

Notes

¹ From Bertolt Brecht's and Kurt Weill's *Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny*, trans. W.D. Auden and Chester Kallman (Toronto: Oxford University Press: 1976), is their mordant utopia where everything is allowed, and nothing permitted except songs about the pieties of capitalism. Songplay or "Singspiel" combines song and talk, projected images, stage sets in this case of an imaginary utopian city, opera motifs, even an onstage audience, and references to archaic texts and satires of authors who may appear in the play in disguise. The "*Mahagonny*" Songplay was written while the "Threepenny Opera" was being composed. Both productions were attacked by right-wing agitators. Both productions can be said to be founded on the aesthetic and dramaturgical Brechtian "functional" theatre. The episodic, journalistic form was developed satirically by Karl Kraus, *Last Days of Mankind*, trans. Fred Bridgham and Edward Timms, (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2015).

² Bertolt Brecht, *Manual of Piety, Poems by Bertolt Brecht: A Bilingual Edition*, trans. Eric Bentley and others (New York: Grove Press, 1966), 9.

³ See Walter Benjamin, *Understanding Brecht*, trans. Anna Bostock, (London: New Left Books, 1973), 120.

⁴ See Pierre Clastres, *Society Against the State*, trans. Robert Hurley, (New York: Zone Books, 1989), in particular pp. 212 – 218.

⁵ The Brecht-Weill opera or Singspiel, *Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny*, 1926, was first performed in 1930 in Leipzig at a time when Brecht was also composing his Breviaries. The opera scandalized the audience, and right-wing agitators attacked the performance. Both "Threepenny Opera" and "City of Mahagonny" were included in the "degenerate music" exhibition of 1938. In 1938 Brecht and Weill were already on the way into exile.

⁶ Ernst Fraenkel, *The Dual State, A Contribution to the Theory of Dictatorship*, trans. E.A. Shils (Clark, New Jersey: The Lawbook Exchange, 2010).

⁷ Jeff Wall, *Dead Troops Talk A Vision after an Ambush of a Red Army Near Moqor, Afghanistan, Winter, 1986*, 1992, Transparency in Lightbox, 229x417 cm, Private Collection, Paris, https://www.thebroad.org/sites/default/files/art/wall_dead_troops_talk_1991-92.jpg.

⁸ Gigantomachy Sculpture, State Museum of Berlin, Berlin, www.smb.museum/en/museums-institutions/pergamon.

⁹ Walter Benjamin, "Theses on the Philosophy of History," in *Illuminations*, trans. Harry Zohn (New York: Harcourt, Brace & World), 1955, 258. Abridged here. Thesis VII is addressed to Brecht's *Threepenny Opera*.

¹⁰ T.W. Adorno, *In Search of Wagner*, "Phantasmagoria," trans. Rodney Livingstone (London: New Left Books), 91.

¹¹ See Sigmund Freud, Lecture XXXI, "The Dissection of the Psychological Personality," *The Complete Introductory Lectures on Psychoanalysis*, trans. James Strachey, (New York: W.W. Norton, 1966), 521ff. This Lecture is only a "primer" of Freud's and is included in the "Breviaries" to indicate that a "Breviary" about the terror of death must include Freud's view that the taboo on death and the origin of "the omnipotence of thought" and "wishful thinking" is the beginning of the dialectic of culture and civilization expressed in Freud's *Civilization and its Discontents*.

¹² *Rabelais and His World*, trans. H. Iswolsky (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984), 6.

¹³ Pieter Bruegel, *Two Chained Monkeys*, 1562, painting on oak wood, w23.0 x h20.0 cm, Gemäldegalerie, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Berlin, <https://artsandculture.google.com/asset/two-chained-monkeys-pieter-bruegel-the-elder/WAHc3JWW3F7kQA?hl=en>. Retrieved November 1, 2019.

¹⁴ T.W. Adorno, *Minima Moralia*, trans. E.F.N. Jephcott (London: New Left Books), 1951.

¹⁵ Boris Friedewald, *The Angels of Paul Klee* (London: Arcadia Books, 2016).

¹⁶ Adorno, *In Search of Wagner*, 91.

¹⁷ Brecht, *Manual of Piety*, 9.

¹⁸ Adorno, *Minima Moralia*, 197.

¹⁹ Walter Benjamin, *The Origin of German Tragic Drama*, trans. John Osborne (London: New Left Books), 184-185.

²⁰ Bertolt Brecht, *Rise and Fall of the City of Mahagonny*, trans. Steve Giles, (London: Methuen Drama, 2007), 58.

²¹ Varlam Shalamov, *Kolyma Tales*, trans. John Glad (London: Penguin Books), 503.

²² Noam Chomsky, *Media Control, The Spectacular Achievements of Propaganda* (New York: Seven Stories Press, 1995), 10. See Brecht's *War Primer*, 1943, a collection of Brecht's mordant aphorisms attached to cut-out photograph clippings from newspapers about the war, showing atrocities, and military leaders in John Heartfield-like vitriolic attacks on Nazi Germany. First published in magazine size format with introduction and translations by John Willett, 1917, it has been reissued by Verso.